Real-time RT-PCR and SYBR Green I melting curve analysis for the identification of Plum pox virus strains C, EA, and W: Effect of amplicon size, melt rate, and dye translocation

Aniko Varga, Delano James *

Sidney Laboratory, Canadian Food Inspection Agency, 8801 East Saanich Road, Sidney, BC, Canada V8L 1H3

Received 23 June 2005; received in revised form 23 September 2005; accepted 3 October 2005
Available online 15 November 2005

Abstract

Real-time RT-PCR and SYBR green I melt curve analysis of a 74 bp amplicon enabled identification of Plum pox virus strains C, EA, and W, with distinct Tm’s associated with each strain. This test is a useful supplement to a real-time RT-PCR test described earlier that was used to distinguish PPV strains D and M. A longer fragment of 155 bp was not effective for strain identification. A simplified one-tube protocol, with dithiothreitol eliminated from the reaction, showed similar sensitivity when compared to a two-tube protocol. For melt curve analysis, a slower melt rate of 0.1 °C/s, compared to 0.4 °C/s, was effective for detecting weak amplicons, and improved resolution of the Tm of amplicons amplified simultaneously. SYBR green I was useful for duplex melt curve analysis. In repeated melt run treatments (total of 14) of a single sample containing co-amplified targets, complete translocation of SYBR green I was observed, going from a 74 bp fragment to a 114 bp fragment. The duration of the melt run may be a critical factor affecting SYBR green I binding and translocation, and its manipulation may facilitate improved resolution and simultaneous detection of multiple targets. This phenomenon may explain inconsistent SYBR green I fluorescence patterns associated with melt curve analysis of some amplicon complexes.

Crown Copyright © 2005 Published by Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved

Keywords: Plum pox virus; Strain typing; Real-time RT-PCR; Melt curve analysis; Melt rate; SYBR green I translocation; SmartCycler®

1. Introduction

Real-time PCR with SYBR Green I melting curve analysis is a simple and reliable technique that has been effective for the detection and identification of various pathogens. These include Leishmania species (Nicolas et al., 2002), animal RNA viruses such as Norwalk-like viruses and viruses infecting penaeid shrimp (Beuret, 2004; Mouillesseaux et al., 2003), and plant RNA viruses such as Plum pox virus (PPV; Varga and James, 2005). This approach to real-time PCR can be adapted for quantitative analysis of the target(s) of interest (Papin et al., 2004). SYBR Green I dye binds non-specifically to double-stranded DNA by intercalation and/or minor groove binding (Lekanne Deprez et al., 2002; Mouillesseaux et al., 2003; Zipper et al., 2004). Specific identification may be achieved by melting curve analysis that can be used for identification at the species level (Nicolas et al., 2002), or even identification of strains of a virus pathogen (Varga and James, 2005).

SYBR green I based detection methods are reliable for detecting nucleic acid targets characterized by sequence variability. Papin et al. (2004) found that use of a probe based assay such as TaqMan resulted in failure to detect 47% of possible single nucleotide variants of West Nile virus, whereas a SYBR green I based assay was just as sensitive, and more importantly, it detected 100% of possible variants. Richards et al. (2004) indicated that in the case of Noroviruses, the use of degenerate primers facilitate broad spectrum detection but that probe-type approaches such as TaqMan require high complementarity for probe binding. This may result in failure to detect viruses that have high sequence variability in the probe-binding region. This uncertainty or false negative result is unacceptable in situations where; (a) the result might affect early initiation of treatment which could make the difference between life and death, and (b) where a false negative result might contribute to the release/introduction of plants infected with pathogens, such as aphid-vectored PPV (Avinent et al., 1994), that may

* Corresponding author. Tel.: +1 250 363 6610x235; fax: +1 250 363 6661.
E-mail address: jamesd@inspection.gc.ca (D. James).
be spread to other hosts in the vicinity. Other advantages of SYBR green-based real-time PCR assays include; easy identification of spurious or non-specific amplification, the ability to detect uncharacterized variants, and reduced time for analysis (Papin et al., 2004; Richards et al., 2004; Varga and James, 2005).

PPV is considered the most serious disease affecting stone fruits, members of the *Prunus* spp. (Nemeth, 1986). There are six recognized strains of PPV including D, M, EA, C, Rec, and W (Wetzel et al., 1991a; Cambra et al., 1994; Nemchinov et al., 1998; Glasa et al., 2004; James and Varga, 2005). These strains vary in aphid transmission, geographic distribution, host range, and pathogenicity, so strain identification is essential for effective control of the virus and improved understanding of the epidemiology of the associated disease.

Varga and James (2005) recently described a real-time multiplex PCR assay using SYBR green I and melt curve analysis for identification of members of the two major strains of PPV, strains D and M. This approach is relatively simple, and more rapid than previously described PPV strain typing methods including RT-PCR with RFLP analysis (Wetzel et al., 1991a), and integrated RT-PCR/tested PCR (Rzeszes et al., 2001). Varga and James (2005) demonstrated reliable identification of isolates of strain D and M in both herbaceous and woody hosts. Strain specific forward primers amplifying fragments of different sizes were combined with universal PPV primers, and primers targeting the endogenous NADH dehydrogenase gene (Menzel et al., 2002), in a multiplex system. This facilitated simultaneous PPV detection, D or M strain identification, and detection of an endogenous control that reduces false negative results. The 74 bp universal fragment, amplified for isolates of all PPV strains tested (Varga and James, 2005), had melting temperature characteristics with the absolute value of the 1st derivative against the temperature. The one-tube RT-PCR reaction was performed with further analysis of the 74 bp or 155 bp universal amplicon, along with the internal amplification control (181 bp amplicon for the Nad5 gene).

2.2. Test design

PPV strain typing in this study is based on SYBR green I melt curve analysis of a single amplicon using a system similar to that developed in the PPV multiplex assay described by Varga and James (2005). Two universal amplicons (74 bp and 155 bp) were compared for their effectiveness and use in identification of PPV strains C, EA, and W. The PPV P1 oligonucleotide primer (Wetzel et al., 1991a), PPV-U, and PPV-RR primer sequences (in 5′ to 3′ orientation) are; ACCGAGACCCTACACCTCCC, TGAAGGCAGCACATTGAGA, and CCTCTCCTTGGTTCCGACGGTTTC, respectively. Attempts at specific identification and strain typing were carried out as follows; if the original multiplex assay (Varga and James, 2005) gave a positive result for PPV, but negative for D or M strain, a second real-time RT-PCR assay was performed with further analysis of the 74 bp or 155 bp universal amplicon, along with the internal amplification control (181 bp amplicon for the Nad5 gene).

2.3. Isolation of total RNA and real-time RT-PCR conditions

Total RNA (from fresh and/or freeze-dried herbaceous and/or woody leaf tissue, as required) was extracted as described by James et al. (2003). Two RT-PCR systems were assessed: (a) a one-tube system as described by Varga and James (2005); and (b) a one-tube system for increased simplicity and reduction of cross-contamination. The one-tube RT-PCR reaction was carried out without DTT, in a 25 µl volume. This consisted of 2.5 µl of a 1/10 water dilution of tRNA (herbaceous or woody) and 22.5 µl of master mix (2.5 µl of Karsai Buffer (Karsai et al., 2002), 0.5 µl each of 5 µM primers PPV-U, PPV-RR or PPV-P1, Nad5F, Nad5S and 10 mM dNTP, 1 µl of 50 mM MgCl₂, 0.2 µl of RNaseOUT™ (40 U/µl, Invitrogen), 0.1 µl each of SUPERSCRIPT™ III (200 U/µl, Invitrogen) and Platinum® Taq DNA Polymerase High Fidelity (5 U/µl, Invitrogen), and 1 µl of 1·5000 (to TE pH 7.5) SYBR green I (Sigma) in 16.1 µl water). Real-time PCR was performed using a SmartCycler® II Thermal Cycler (Cepheid, Sunnyvale, CA) with data interpretation using SmartCycler® Software Version 2.0d. The one-tube cycling parameters consisted of a 10 min incubation at 50°C followed by 2-step PCR: 2 min incubation at 95°C followed by threshold-dependent cycling for 15 s at 95°C, and 60 s at 60°C, where cycling advanced to melt stage once total fluorescence passed threshold (manual setting of 20) plus an extra nine cycles. Fluorescence readings were taken during the anneal/extension step (60°C incubation). Following threshold-dependent cycling, melting was performed from 60 to 95°C at either 0.1 or 0.4°C/s melt rates with a smooth curve setting averaging 1 point. Melting peaks were visualized by plotting the absolute value of the 1st derivative against the temperature. The melting temperature (Tm) was defined as the peak of the curve, and if the highest point was a plateau, then the midpoint was identified as the Tm. For electrophoretic analysis, PCR products (10 µl) were separated on a 1.5% agarose (BioRad) gel in TBE buffer, at 80 V for 60 min, with ethidium bromide staining.

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Virus source

PPV C (a sweet cherry isolate) and PPV EA (El Amar) were obtained as freeze dried tissue samples from A. Myrta, Italy. These isolates were maintained in the herbaceous host *Nicotiana benthamiana*. PPV 2630 (D-2630) is a Canadian type D isolate mechanically sap-transmitted from peach (*Prunus persica* var. Redhaven) to *N. benthamiana*. The virus isolate W3174 is a Canadian isolate of PPV detected in plum (*Prunus domestica*), and mechanically sap-transmitted to *N. benthamiana*. This isolate represents a new strain of PPV; strain W (James and Varga, 2005).
3. Results

3.1. One tube real-time multiplex RT-PCR assay versus two-tube assay; sensitivity comparison

The one-tube real-time multiplex RT-PCR assay, as adapted from the two-tube procedure, was more sensitive with a broader range of detection. Amplification was observed with serially water-diluted total RNA extracts from infected herbaceous hosts, at $10^{-6}$ dilution (data not shown). Dilution of cDNA was no longer required with the one tube RT-PCR thus limiting and reducing any chance for contamination and/or technical error. This indicates a more robust reaction. Also, the initial cDNA synthesis reaction time was reduced from 60 to 10 min, with an overall reduction in assay time. Dithiothreitol (DTT), commonly added to enzyme mixtures for stabilization and/or maintaining activity, is a potential real-time PCR inhibitor that may delay cycle threshold ($C_t$) values (Pierce et al., 2002). DTT was removed from the one-tube assay with no loss in sensitivity observed.

3.2. SYBR green I translocation between amplicons

An interesting observation regarding melt peak analysis was made during sensitivity comparisons between the two-tube real-time multiplex RT-PCR versus the one-tube strain typing assay. Full translocation of SYBR green I from one amplicon to another was observed over repeated melt runs, during a time-course of melt analysis (Fig. 1A-D). Initially most of the SYBR green I was associated with the 74 bp fragment compared to the 114 bp D-specific fragment (Fig. 1A). However, following a total of 14 repeated melt runs on the same samples, the SYBR green I became almost completely associated with the 114 bp fragment and the melt peak for the 74 bp is barely discernable. Fig. 1A-D indicate melt number 1, 3, 8 and 14, respectively, clearly showing the relocation of the SYBR green I dye and accompanying fluorescence levels. Electrophoresis showed bands for both the 74 bp and 114 bp products (gel not shown).

3.3. Strain-specific $T_m$ as a function of strain, amplicon size, and melt rate

The melting temperatures ($T_m$) of the 74 bp amplicons were distinct for C, EA, and W strains at both 0.1 and 0.4 °C/s melt rates (Fig. 2). Strain C had the lowest $T_m$ (mean 79.84 °C/80.94 °C) while strain EA was highest (av. 81.27 °C/82.40 °C) at both the 0.1 and 0.4 °C/s melt rates, respectively (Fig. 2). Increasing the melt rate from 0.1 to 0.4 °C/s shifted the $T_m$ higher across all strains, an average of approximately 1.08 °C. The shift in $T_m$ was not constant across strains. The relative $T_m$ difference between strains C and EA going from a melt rate of 0.1 to 0.4 °C/s was 1.43 and 1.46 °C, respectively (Fig. 2). The relative $T_m$ difference for W3174 compared to EA was 0.59 and 0.85 °C at 0.1 and 0.4 °C/s melt rate, respectively. The relative $T_m$ difference between C and W3174 was median at 1.02 and 0.91 °C at 0.1 and 0.4 °C/s, respectively.

Fig. 1. Melt peak analysis of duplex targets over a series of melt runs showing translocation of SYBR green I over time. The reaction tube was subjected to a total of 14 consecutive melt runs, with A–D representing melt run number 1, 3, 8, and 14, respectively. After melt run number 1 (A), most SYBR green I is associated with the 74 bp fragment ($T_m$ of 81.3 °C) while less is associated with the 114 bp fragment ($T_m$ of 85.06 °C). After a total of 14 melt runs, most of the SYBR green is associated with the 114 bp amplicon ($T_m$ of 84.56 °C) (D). Gel electrophoresis (1.5% agarose/TBE gel with Ethidium bromide staining) confirmed the presence of both amplicons.
The $T_m$'s associated with the 155 bp amplicons were higher in general than that of the 74 bp fragment. There was some loss of resolution with overlap of the average $T_m$ values of the three strains, at both ramp rates (Fig. 3). Overlapping $T_m$'s occurred between strains W and EA, ranging from 84.94 to 85.95 °C. However it was possible to distinguish strain C, from EA and W. The strain C fragment has $T_m$'s of 85.94 and 86.82 °C at melt rates of 0.1 and 0.4 °C/s, respectively, compared to 84.95–85.07 °C and 85.76–85.95 °C for EA and W at melt rates 0.1 and 0.4 °C/s, respectively (Fig. 3). The $T_m$ was lowest for EA and W strains, and highest for strain C at both the 0.1 and 0.4 °C/s melt rates (Fig. 3). Increasing the melt rate from 0.1 to 0.4 °C/s resulted in an upward shift of the $T_m$ across all strains, on average 0.86 °C (Fig. 3). Again, the increase in $T_m$ was not constant across all strains.

### 3.4. Influence of melt rate on the detection of weak amplicons

Following PCR amplification, samples were subjected to two melt runs, with melt rates of either 0.1 or 0.4 °C/s. Melt peaks were observed for both the 74 bp fragment ($T_m$ of 80.0 °C) and 181 bp control fragment ($T_m$ of 82.14 °C), at 0.1 °C/s (Fig. 4A). Larger more discernable melt peaks were associated with the 0.4 °C/s melt rate with $T_m$'s of 80.97 and 82.67 °C for the 74 bp and 181 bp amplicons, respectively (Fig. 4B). Increasing the melt rate increased the size of the melt peaks due to a more rapid loss of fluorescence, facilitating more reliable detection of weaker amplicons (Fig. 4B). The typical $T_m$ shift (lower to higher with increased melt rates) was observed.

### 3.5. Influence of melt rate on the discrimination of close $T_m$'s

When two amplicons melt at similar temperatures, a slow melt rate (resulting in higher $T_m$ resolution) resulted in improved discrimination of the melt peaks (Fig. 5). At a melt rate of 0.1 °C/s, melt peaks were observed for both the 74 bp amplicon ($T_m$ 80.8 °C, strain W), and the 181 bp internal control fragment
in $T_m$ does not appear equal between different fragments. This results in the $T_m$ of one fragment approaching that of the second and becoming indistinguishable (Fig. 5B). This effect is reversible since if subjected to repeated melting at 0.1 °C/s melt rate, two melt peaks became visible (data not shown). The loss in peak resolution may be related also to both the increase in size, and temperature shift of melt peaks at higher melt rates (Figs. 4 and 5).

3.6. Influence of tissue type on $T_m$ using the 74 bp and 155 bp fragments associated with strains W and D (D-2630)

The effects of host tissue type (leaves from herbaceous N. benthamiana or woody Prunus sp.) on $T_m$ were determined for both the 74 bp and 155 bp fragments, at two melt rates. Two strains of PPV (W3174 and D-2630) were compared. Both are Canadian isolates that were available in fresh herbaceous and woody tissue. Strict quarantine regulations restrict the importation into Canada of Prunus infected with PPV strains C or EA, hence they were not evaluated. Herbaceous or woody host tissue type did not affect significantly the $T_m$ associated with either the W3174 or D-2630 strain, for the 74 bp amplicon or the 155 bp amplicon, at either rate (Tables 1 and 2, respectively). An upward shift in $T_m$, with an increase in melt rate from 0.1 to 0.4 °C/s, was observed for the target in both hosts (Tables 1 and 2), indicating that the phenomenon is not host specific.

The effect on $T_m$ of freeze drying herbaceous or woody tissue was examined, using tissue infected with strain W. In this case, there were no significant differences between the $T_m$ observed for amplicons derived from RNA extracts from infected fresh herbaceous tissue, fresh woody tissue, or freeze-dried woody tissue ($T_m$ C ± S.D.) of 80.76 ± 0.15, 80.77 ± 0.16, and 80.68 ± 0.09, respectively). Freeze-dried herbaceous tissue was not tested.

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tissue Type</th>
<th>0.1 °C/s</th>
<th>0.4 °C/s</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fresh Herbaceous</td>
<td>80.68 ± 0.09</td>
<td>81.68 ± 0.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freeze-Dried</td>
<td>80.70 ± 0.08</td>
<td>81.47 ± 0.19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Herbaceous host Nicotiana benthamiana.

Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tissue Type</th>
<th>0.1 °C/s</th>
<th>0.4 °C/s</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fresh Herbaceous</td>
<td>85.01 ± 0.09</td>
<td>86.29 ± 0.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freeze-Dried</td>
<td>85.37 ± 0.55</td>
<td>86.18 ± 0.40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Herbaceous host Nicotiana benthamiana.

Fig. 5. Melt peak analysis showing a loss of resolution of weak amplicons with an increased melt rate, for strain W fresh, woody tissue, a 1/40 water dilution of RNA. Following RT-PCR, the reaction tube was subjected to two melt rates: 0.1 and 0.4 °C/s. At 0.1 °C/s (A), two melt peaks representing the 74 bp and 181 bp amplicons are observed ($T_m$s of 80.6 and 82.34 °C, respectively). At 0.4 °C/s (B), the melt peak temperature shifts higher and only one melt peak is discernible, representing the 181 bp amplicon with a $T_m$ of 82.45 °C.
4. Discussion

Real-time PCR is a powerful diagnostic tool capable of rapidly generating reliable and reproducible results with reduced risks of cross contamination (MacKay, 2004). In this study, single-tube real-time RT-PCR with SYBR green I dye and melting curve analysis of a 74 bp amplicon were used for reliable identification of isolates of PPV strains C, EA, and W. When combined with the protocol described by Varga and James (2005) specific strain typing of members of all strains of PPV is possible, except strain PPV-Rec. PPV-Rec represents a group consisting of isolates that result from a recombination of PPV-D and PPV-M, with the PPV-M coat protein (CP) coding region at the 3' terminus (Glassa et al., 2004). Based on sequence analysis, the procedure of Varga and James (2005), which targets the CP, will likely identify PPV-Rec as PPV-M. PPV-M is considered a severe (Kerlan and Dunez, 1979) and less desirable type of PPV. Any identification of PPV-M would trigger detailed analysis in the CP region and regions upstream such as the Nb and P3/6K1 region, which would facilitate identification of PPV-Rec (Glassa et al., 2002). Efforts to identify real-time RT-PCR strategies for simultaneous detection that include PPV-Rec are ongoing.

The real-time PCR approach described in this study utilizes the inexpensive dsDNA intercalating dye SYBR green I. There are two general approaches to amplicon detection, specific and non-specific fluorescent reporting chemistries. Both display similar levels of sensitivity (Wittwer et al., 1997; Bustin and Nolan, 2004a). The use of specific probe based assays such as TaqMan may result in false negative results, especially in RNA viruses (Papin et al., 2004; Richards et al., 2004; Varga and James, 2005). SYBR green I melt curve analysis is a useful detection strategy for routine use because of high costs, complexity, and lack of robustness (Martin et al., 2000). To increase simplicity, a one tube protocol adapted from a two tube procedure was developed, with no loss in sensitivity observed. The assay was reliable over a wide range of template (total RNA) concentrations, and there was a significant reduction in time (about 1 h), compared to the two-tube assay. Dithiothreitol was removed from the reaction mixture with no loss in sensitivity detected. DTT has been recognized to negatively interfere with RT-PCR using SYBR green I-Lekanne Deprez et al., 2002; Peerce et al., 2002). Other one-step RT-PCR protocols for RNA-virus detection have been optimized without DTT inclusion (Pastorino et al., 2005).

Complete translocation of SYBR green I dye from one amplicon to another was observed over a series of repeated melt runs on the same sample. This is an important phenomenon since it will be useful for improving the resolution of multiple targets in a single reaction, and possibly explains certain events observed in real-time PCR analysis. Fragments amplified in real-time PCR with melt curve analysis may be clearly visible on a gel, yet no associated melt peaks are observed. Two reports have shown discrepancies between melt peak data and gel electrophoresis (Giglio et al., 2003; Monis et al., 2005). Consequently concern was expressed about the reliability and usefulness of SYBR green I dye (Monis et al., 2005). It seems that too long a melt cycle may result in either translocation or preferential intercalation of SYBR green I with one fragment (represented by one melt peak), while more than one fragment is visible on a gel. A quicker melt cycle may remedy this anomaly. Monis et al. (2005) compared SYTO9 with SYBR green I for use in melt curve analyses. They used melt curve analyses settings of 1°C steps with a hold of 10, 30, or 60 s at each step from 60 to 97°C or 99°C (depending on the loci), compared to the present study where 0.1 or 0.4°C/sec melt rates (no hold) from 60 to 95°C were used. In the study by Monis et al. (2005), a loss of one of the melt peaks was observed at either low SYBR green I concentrations or low template concentrations, however both amplicons (detected from melt peak plots) were observed with SYTO9 across a broader range of dye concentrations and initial template DNA concentrations. In the present study, it seems that SYBR green I was not limiting but translocated from one amplicon to another after repeated melt runs (14 runs over 84 min). SYBR green I translocation (not preferential binding) is supported by the fact that the area under the curve of a melt peak is proportional to the amount of product (Wilhelm and Pingoud, 2003). As no new product is being generated during a melt run, the peak is growing only as a result of SYBR green I translocation. This suggests that the binding pattern of SYBR green I is time and temperature dependent. SYBR green I is effective in duplex (this study) or multiplex reactions (Varga and James, 2005) when melt curves are generated quickly, eliminating the translocation events.

Giglio et al. (2003) observed a similar translocation event between amplicons (ctxAB and hsvL), with melt regimes of 20 or 40 cycles. The translocation of SYBR green I between the two loci may be an artifact of the melt settings. The melt protocol is stated as including a ramping rate of 1°C/60 s, assumed to be a 60 s hold, which is similar to Monis et al. (2005). The data from the present study on PPV identification suggests that the duration of the melt run is a critical factor in SYBR green melt curve analysis. Translocation of SYBR green I during melt runs may be reduced by melting samples quickly, which may facilitate simultaneous detection of all amplicons. However, care must be taken if increasing melt rate (e.g., 0.1 to 0.4°C/s or higher) as a loss in sensitivity detecting weak amplicons may occur.

Successful SYBR green I multiplex melt curve analyses appear to be associated with quicker melt runs than those used by Monis et al. (2005). Beuuet (2004) used melt parameters consisting of 0’s or 1.5 incubation times and temperature transition rates of 20°C/C on ROCHE’s LightCycler®; Hernandez et al. (2003), and Richards et al. (2004) used a melt transition rate of 0.2°C/C on CEPIEDI’S SmartCyler® and Applied Biosystem’s ABI PRISM® 7700 (no hold time is given), respectively. Papp et al. (2003) used melt parameters consisting of 0.2°C/min from 60 to 92°C on the Applied Biosystems’ ABI 7700, while Varga and James (2005) used a melt transition rate of 0.1°C/C on Cepheid’s
SmartCycler® for multiplex analyses. Melt settings and optional parameters vary between thermocyclers (Bustin and Nolan, 2004b), thus confounding resolution and interpretation of SYBR green I melt curve analyses. SYTO9 may help in melting peak resolution where real-time machines require a hold setting at each melt temperature to equilibrate block-type machines using Peltier- or Joule-based technologies. SYBR green I and SYTO9 differ slightly in their spectral characteristics with optimal excitation/emission wavelengths of 497/520 nm and 485/498 nm (Molecular Probes/Invitrogen, Carlsbad), respectively. The spectral characteristics of the machine must be considered in deciding on the fluorescence dye suitable for optimal assay performance. For example, since the FAM channel on the SmartCycler® includes an excitation and emission maxima of 450–495 nm and 510–527 nm, respectively, optimal detection of SYTO9 (emission at 498 nm) would not be realised. Reliable and reproducible melt curve analysis may not depend solely on dye type (SYBR green I or SYTO9) but also on the different machine capabilities.

Melt rate has an impact on melt peak resolution. A higher melt rate decreases the number of readings over time, therefore, loss of fluorescence is larger than at a lower melt rate. In addition, a melt rate of 0.1 °C/s is more sensitive to changes in fluorescence than a 0.4 °C/s as four times more fluorescence readings are taken. Higher resolution of Tm’s is accomplished at the slower rate of 0.1 °C/s; however, greater resolution of weak amplicons occurs at the higher rate, as the peaks are larger in size. A trade off exists where at a slower rate melt amplicons occurs at the higher rate, as the peaks are larger, but the Tm has a higher associated standard deviation. Further comparisons on different machines and associated software would determine if the resolution of weak amplicons is improved with increased melt rate, or if this is peculiar to the SmartCycler® interface. No literature is available examining the interaction of melt rate, hold settings, data acquisition and subsequent software analyses, and SYBR green I melt curve analysis in multiplex reactions.

Melt rate also affected the resolution of Tm’s. At 0.1 °C/s melt rate, melt peaks were distinct giving an increased resolution of peaks, however, a loss of peak resolution occurred with a ramp rate of 0.4 °C/s when the Tm’s of the two amplicons were close. This is related to the shift in Tm from low to high which is associated with a low to high shift in melt rate (Ririe et al., 1997), as well as the machine’s optics and/or software interpretation of fluorescence data. The Tm shift is not even between amplicons consequently a melding of the peaks is observed. Further study is needed to elucidate this phenomenon with SYBR green I melt curve analyses, especially to determine if it is an artifact of instrumentation. The type of real-time instrument (ROCHE’s LightCycler®, Applied Biosystems ABI PRISM® 7700, and Corbett’s Rotor Gene 3000TM) did have significant impacts on the Tm derived from SYBR green I melt curve analysis over a time-course (using repeated melt runs of approximately 6 min each) may mimic what is happening in other machines with melt runs that are typically much longer (20–80 min), as hold steps during melt rate may be longer to approach and maintain block uniformity in some cyclers.

Acknowledgements

We wish to express our gratitude to Arben Myrta for freeze dried samples of PPV C (a sweet cherry isolate) and PPV EA. Also, we would like to thank the CFIA St. Catharines PPV survey crew for providing samples of PPV W3174 and PPV D (2630).
References


References


